

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

-----X
VALERIE LEVINE,

Case No. 1:23-cv-08112

Plaintiff,

**STIPULATED
PROTECTIVE ORDER
REGARDING THE
DISCLOSURE OF
DISCOVERY
MATERIALS**

- against -

APPLE INC. AND APPLE FIFTH AVENUE,

Defendants.
-----X

IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED by and among the attorneys for the parties in the above-captioned action that:

The Parties herein anticipate that documents, testimony, or information containing or reflecting confidential, proprietary, trade secret, and/or commercially sensitive information are likely to be disclosed or produced during the course of discovery in this case and request that the Court enter this Order setting forth the conditions for treating, obtaining, and using such information.

1. **PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS**

(a) Protected Material (defined below) designated under the terms of this Protective Order shall be used by a Receiving Party (defined below) solely for this case, and shall not be used directly or indirectly for any other purpose whatsoever.

(b) The Parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures during discovery. Designations under this Order shall be made with care and

shall not be made absent a good faith belief that the designated material satisfies the criteria set forth below.

(c) Nothing contained in this Order is intended to or shall serve to limit a Party's right to conduct a review of documents, electronically stored information or information (including metadata) for relevance, responsiveness and/or segregation of privileged or protected information before production.

2. **DEFINITIONS**

(a) "Discovery Material" means all items or information, including from any non-party, regardless of the medium or manner generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things, testimony, transcripts, or tangible things) that are produced, disclosed, or generated in connection with discovery in this case.

(b) "Outside Counsel" means (i) outside counsel who appear on the pleadings as counsel for a Party and (ii) partners, associates, and staff of such counsel to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this litigation.

(c) "Party" means any party to this case, including all of its officers, directors, employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel and their support staffs.

(d) "Producing Party" means any Party or non-party that discloses or produces any Discovery Material in this case.

(e) "Protected Material" means any Discovery Material that is designated as "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL - ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY," as provided for in this Order.

(f) "Receiving Party" means any Party who receives Discovery Material from a Producing Party.

3. **COMPUTATION OF TIME**

The computation of any period of time prescribed or allowed by this Order shall be governed by the provisions for computing time set forth in the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.

4. **SCOPE**

(a) The protections conferred by this Order cover not only Discovery Material governed by this Order as addressed herein, but also any information copied or extracted therefrom, as well as all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations thereof, plus testimony, conversations, or presentations by Parties or their counsel in court or in other settings that might reveal Protected Material.

(b) Nothing in this Protective Order shall prevent or restrict a Producing Party's own disclosure or use of its own Protected Material for any purpose, and nothing in this Order shall preclude any Producing Party from showing its Protected Material to an individual who prepared the Protected Material.

(c) Nothing in this Order shall be construed to prejudice any Party's right to use any Protected Material in court or in any court filing with the consent of the Producing Party or by order of the Court.

(d) This Order is without prejudice to the right of any Party to seek further or additional protection of any Discovery Material or to seek to modify this Order in any way, including, without limitation, an order that certain matter not be produced at all.

5. **DURATION**

Even after the termination of this case, the confidentiality obligations imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Producing Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs.

6. **ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

(a) **Basic Principles.** All Protected Material shall be used solely for this case or any related appellate proceeding, and not for any other purpose whatsoever, including without limitation any other litigation, patent prosecution or acquisition, patent reexamination or reissue proceedings, or any business or competitive purpose or function. Protected Material shall not be distributed, disclosed or made available to anyone except as expressly provided in this Order.

(b) **Secure Storage, No Export.** Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location in the United States and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order. To ensure compliance with applicable United States Export Administration Regulations, Protected Material may not be exported outside the United States or released to any foreign national (even if within the United States).

(c) **Legal Advice Based on Protected Material.** Nothing in this Protective Order shall be construed to prevent counsel from advising their clients with respect to this case based in whole or in part upon Protected Materials, provided counsel does not disclose the Protected Material itself except as provided in this Order.

(d) **Limitations.** Nothing in this Order shall restrict in any way a Producing Party's use or disclosure of its own Protected Material. Nothing in this Order shall restrict in any

way the use or disclosure of Discovery Material by a Receiving Party with the consent of the Producing Party or pursuant to order of the Court.

7. **DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL**

(a) Available Designations. Any Producing Party may designate Discovery Material as CONFIDENTIAL.

(b) Written Discovery and Documents and Tangible Things. Written discovery, documents, and tangible things that meet the requirements for confidentiality may be so designated by placing the appropriate designation on every page of the written material prior to production. For digital files being produced, the Producing Party may mark each viewable page or image with the appropriate designation, and mark the medium, container, and/or communication in which the digital files were contained. In the event that original documents are produced for inspection, the original documents shall be presumed “CONFIDENTIAL” during the inspection and re-designated, as appropriate during the copying process.

(c) Native Files. Where electronic files and documents are produced in native electronic format, such electronic files and documents shall be designated for protection under this Order by appending to the file names or designators information indicating whether the file contains “CONFIDENTIAL” material, or shall use any other reasonable method for so designating Protected Materials produced in electronic format. When electronic files or documents are printed for use at deposition, in a court proceeding, or for provision in printed form to an expert or consultant, the party printing the electronic files or documents shall affix a legend to the printed document corresponding to the designation of the Designating Party and including the production number and designation associated with the native file. No one shall seek to use in this litigation a .tiff, .pdf or other image format version of a document produced in native file format without

first (1) providing a copy of the image format version to the Producing Party so that the Producing Party can review the image to ensure that no information has been altered, and (2) obtaining the consent of the Producing Party, which consent shall not be unreasonably withheld.

(d) Depositions and Testimony. Parties or testifying persons or entities may designate depositions and other testimony with the appropriate designation by indicating on the record at the time the testimony is given or by sending written notice of how portions of the transcript of the testimony is designated within thirty (30) days of receipt of the transcript of the testimony. If no indication on the record is made, all information disclosed during a deposition shall be deemed “CONFIDENTIAL” until the time within which it may be appropriately designated as provided for herein has passed. Any Party that wishes to disclose the transcript, or information contained therein prior to the end of the thirty (30) day period, may provide written notice of its intent to treat the transcript as non-confidential, after which time, any Party that wants to maintain any portion of the transcript as confidential must designate the confidential portions within fourteen (14) days, or else the transcript may be treated as non-confidential. Any Protected Material that is used in the taking of a deposition shall remain subject to the provisions of this Protective Order, along with the transcript pages of the deposition testimony dealing with such Protected Material. In such cases the court reporter shall be informed of this Protective Order and shall be required to operate in a manner consistent with this Protective Order. In the event the deposition is videotaped, the original and all copies of the videotape shall be marked by the video technician to indicate that the contents of the videotape are subject to this Protective Order, substantially along the lines of “This videotape contains confidential testimony used in this case and is not to be viewed or the contents thereof to be displayed or revealed except pursuant to the terms of the operative Protective Order in this matter or pursuant to written stipulation of

the parties.” Counsel for any Producing Party shall have the right to exclude from oral depositions, other than the deponent, deponent’s counsel, the reporter and videographer (if any), any person who is not authorized by this Protective Order to receive or access Protected Material based on the designation of such Protected Material. Such right of exclusion shall be applicable only during periods of examination or testimony regarding such Protected Material.

8. **DISCOVERY MATERIAL DESIGNATED AS “CONFIDENTIAL”**

(a) A Producing Party may designate Discovery Material as “CONFIDENTIAL” if it contains or reflects confidential, proprietary, and/or commercially sensitive information.

(b) Unless otherwise ordered by the Court, Discovery Material designated as “CONFIDENTIAL” may be disclosed only to the following:

(i) The Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel, such counsel’s immediate paralegals and staff, and any copying or clerical litigation support services working at the direction of such counsel, paralegals, and staff;

(ii) Not more than three (3) representatives of the Receiving Party who are officers or employees of the Receiving Party, who may be, but need not be, in-house counsel for the Receiving Party, as well as their immediate paralegals and staff, to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this case, provided that each such person has agreed to be bound by the provisions of the Protective Order by signing a copy of Exhibit A; and

(iii) Any outside expert or consultant retained by the Receiving Party to assist in this action, provided that disclosure is only to the extent necessary to perform such work; and provided that: (a) such expert or consultant has agreed to be bound by the provisions of the Protective Order by signing a copy of Exhibit A; (b) such expert or consultant is not a current

officer, director, or employee of a Party or of a competitor of a Party, nor anticipated at the time of retention to become an officer, director or employee of a Party or of a competitor of a Party; and (c) such expert or consultant accesses the materials in the United States only, and does not transport them to or access them from any foreign jurisdiction;

(iv) Court reporters, stenographers and videographers retained to record testimony taken in this action;

(v) The Court, jury, and court personnel;

(vi) Graphics, translation, design, and/or trial consulting personnel, having first agreed to be bound by the provisions of the Protective Order by signing a copy of Exhibit A;

(vii) Mock jurors who have signed an undertaking or agreement agreeing not to publicly disclose Protected Material and to keep any information concerning Protected Material confidential;

(viii) Any mediator who is assigned to hear this matter, and his or her staff, subject to their agreement to maintain confidentiality to the same degree as required by this Protective Order; and

(ix) Any other person with the prior written consent of the Producing Party, who has agreed to be bound by the provisions of the Protective Order by signing a copy of Exhibit A.

9. **CHALLENGING DESIGNATIONS OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

(a) A Party shall not be obligated to challenge the propriety of any designation of Discovery Material under this Order at the time the designation is made, and a failure to do so shall not preclude a subsequent challenge thereto.

(b) Any challenge to a designation of Discovery Material under this Order shall be written, shall be served on outside counsel for the Producing Party, shall particularly identify the documents or information that the Receiving Party contends should be differently designated, and shall state the grounds for the objection. Thereafter, further protection of such material shall be resolved in accordance with the following procedures:

(i) The objecting Party shall have the burden of conferring either in person, in writing, or by telephone with the Producing Party claiming protection (as well as any other interested party) in a good faith effort to resolve the dispute. The Producing Party shall have the burden of justifying the disputed designation;

(ii) Failing agreement, the Receiving Party may bring a motion to the Court for a ruling that the Discovery Material in question is not entitled to the status and protection of the Producing Party's designation. The Parties' entry into this Order shall not preclude or prejudice either Party from arguing for or against any designation, establish any presumption that a particular designation is valid, or alter the burden of proof that would otherwise apply in a dispute over discovery or disclosure of information;

(iii) Notwithstanding any challenge to a designation, the Discovery Material in question shall continue to be treated as designated under this Order until one of the following occurs: (a) the Party who designated the Discovery Material in question withdraws such designation in writing; or (b) the Court rules that the Discovery Material in question is not entitled to the designation.

10. **SUBPOENAS OR COURT ORDERS**

(a) If at any time Protected Material is subpoenaed by any court, arbitral, administrative, or legislative body, the Party to whom the subpoena or other request is directed

shall immediately give prompt written notice thereof to every Party who has produced such Discovery Material and to its counsel and shall provide each such Party with an opportunity to move for a protective order regarding the production of Protected Materials implicated by the subpoena.

11. **FILING PROTECTED MATERIAL**

(a) Absent written permission from the Producing Party or a court Order secured after appropriate notice to all interested persons, a Receiving Party may not file or disclose in the public record any Protected Material.

(b) Any Party is authorized under the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and local rules as may apply to file under seal with the Court any brief, document or materials that are designated as Protected Material under this Order.

12. **INADVERTENT DISCLOSURE OF PRIVILEGED MATERIAL**

(a) The inadvertent production by a Party of Discovery Material subject to the attorney-client privilege, work-product protection, or any other applicable privilege or protection, despite the Producing Party's reasonable efforts to prescreen such Discovery Material prior to production, will not waive the applicable privilege and/or protection if a request for return of such inadvertently produced Discovery Material is made promptly after the Producing Party learns of its inadvertent production. This Order shall be interpreted to provide the maximum protection allowed by Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26.

(b) Upon a request from any Producing Party who has inadvertently produced Discovery Material that it believes is privileged and/or protected, each Receiving Party shall immediately return such Protected Material or Discovery Material and all copies to the Producing

Party, except for any pages containing privileged markings by the Receiving Party which shall instead be destroyed and certified as such by the Receiving Party to the Producing Party.

(c) Nothing herein shall prevent the Receiving Party from preparing a record for its own use containing the date, author, addresses, and topic of the inadvertently produced Discovery Material and such other information as is reasonably necessary to identify the Discovery Material and describe its nature to the Court in any motion to compel production of the Discovery Material.

13. **INADVERTENT FAILURE TO DESIGNATE PROPERLY**

(a) The inadvertent failure by a Producing Party to designate Discovery Material as Protected Material with one of the designations provided for under this Order shall not waive any such designation provided that the Producing Party notifies all Receiving Parties that such Discovery Material is protected under one of the categories of this Order within fourteen (14) days of the Producing Party learning of the inadvertent failure to designate. The Producing Party shall reproduce the Protected Material with the correct confidentiality designation within seven (7) days upon its notification to the Receiving Parties. Upon receiving the Protected Material with the correct confidentiality designation, the Receiving Parties shall return or securely destroy, at the Producing Party's option, all Discovery Material that was not designated properly.

(b) A Receiving Party shall not be in breach of this Order for any use of such Discovery Material before the Receiving Party receives such notice that such Discovery Material is protected under one of the categories of this Order, unless an objectively reasonable person would have realized that the Discovery Material should have been appropriately designated with a confidentiality designation under this Order. Once a Receiving Party has received notification of the correct confidentiality designation for the Protected Material with the correct confidentiality

designation, the Receiving Party shall treat such Discovery Material at the appropriately designated level pursuant to the terms of this Order.

14. **INADVERTENT DISCLOSURE NOT AUTHORIZED BY ORDER**

(a) In the event of a disclosure of any Discovery Material pursuant to this Order to any person or persons not authorized to receive such disclosure under this Protective Order, the Party responsible for having made such disclosure, and each Party with knowledge thereof, shall immediately notify counsel for the Producing Party whose Discovery Material has been disclosed and provide to such counsel all known relevant information concerning the nature and circumstances of the disclosure. The responsible disclosing Party shall also promptly take all reasonable measures to retrieve the improperly disclosed Discovery Material and to ensure that no further or greater unauthorized disclosure and/or use thereof is made

(b) Unauthorized or inadvertent disclosure does not change the status of Discovery Material or waive the right to hold the disclosed document or information as Protected.

15. **FINAL DISPOSITION**

(a) Not later than ninety (90) days after the Final Disposition of this case, each Party shall return all Discovery Material of a Producing Party to the respective Outside Counsel of the Producing Party or destroy such Material, at the option of the Producing Party. For purposes of this Order, “Final Disposition” occurs after an order, mandate, or dismissal finally terminating the above-captioned action with prejudice, including all appeals.

(b) All Parties that have received any such Discovery Material shall certify in writing that all such materials have been returned to the respective Outside Counsel of the Producing Party or destroyed. Notwithstanding the provisions for return of Discovery Material,

Outside Counsel may retain one set of pleadings, correspondence and attorney and consultant work product (but not document productions) for archival purposes.

16. **DISCOVERY FROM EXPERTS OR CONSULTANTS**

(a) Absent good cause, drafts of reports of testifying experts, and reports and other written materials, including drafts, of consulting experts, shall not be discoverable.

(b) Reports and materials exempt from discovery under the foregoing Paragraph shall be treated as attorney work product for the purposes of this case and Protective Order.

17. **MISCELLANEOUS**

(a) Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its modification by the Court in the future. By stipulating to this Order, the Parties do not waive the right to argue that certain material may require additional or different confidentiality protections than those set forth herein.

(b) Termination of Matter and Retention of Jurisdiction. The Parties agree that the terms of this Protective Order shall survive and remain in effect after the Final Determination of the above-captioned matter. The Court shall retain jurisdiction after Final Determination of this matter to hear and resolve any disputes arising out of this Protective Order.

(c) Successors. This Order shall be binding upon the Parties hereto, their attorneys, and their successors, executors, personal representatives, administrators, heirs, legal representatives, assigns, subsidiaries, divisions, employees, agents, retained consultants and experts, and any persons or organizations over which they have direct control.

(d) Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order, no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or

producing any information or item. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order. This Order shall not constitute a waiver of the right of any Party to claim in this action or otherwise that any Discovery Material, or any portion thereof, is privileged or otherwise non-discoverable, or is not admissible in evidence in this action or any other proceeding.


(e) Burdens of Proof. Notwithstanding anything to the contrary above, nothing in this Protective Order shall be construed to change the burdens of proof or legal standards applicable in disputes regarding whether particular Discovery Material is confidential, which level of confidentiality is appropriate, whether disclosure should be restricted, and if so, what restrictions should apply.

(f) Modification by Court. The United States District Courts for the Southern District of New York are responsible for the interpretation and enforcement of this Order. All disputes concerning Protected Material, however designated, produced under the protection of this Order shall be resolved by the United States District Courts for the Southern District of New York.

(g) Discovery Rules Remain Unchanged. Nothing herein shall alter or change in any way the discovery provisions of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and other applicable law and rules, or the Court's own orders. Identification of any individual pursuant to this Protective Order does not make that individual available for deposition or any other form of discovery outside of the restrictions and procedures of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and other applicable law and rules, or the Court's own orders.

SO STIPULATED.

Dated: 4/16/2024



Katia Asche
ArentFox Schiff LLP
1301 Sixth Avenue
42nd Floor
New York, NY 10019
*Attorneys for Defendant Apple Inc. (i/s/h/a
"Apple Fifth Avenue")*

Dated: 

4/16/2024

David Owens
Molod Spitz & DeSantis, P.C.
1430 Broadway, 21st Floor
New York, NY 10018
Attorneys for Plaintiff Valerie Levine

The parties are apprised that the Court retains discretion as to whether to afford confidential treatment in its opinions and orders to information the parties have redacted, sealed, or designated as confidential. The Court retains the discretion to allow disclosure of any subject covered by this stipulation or to modify this stipulation at any time in the interest of justice.

SO ORDERED.



Dale E. Ho
United States District Judge
Dated: April 17, 2024
New York, New York

EXHIBIT A

I, _____, acknowledge and declare that I have received a copy of the Protective Order (“Order”) in Valerie Levine v. Apple Inc., et al., United States District Court, Southern District of New York, Case No. 1:23-cv-08112. Having read and understood the terms of the Order, I agree to be bound by the terms of the Order and consent to the jurisdiction of said Court for the purpose of any proceeding to enforce the terms of the Order.

Name of individual: _____

Present occupation/job description: _____

Name of Company or Firm: _____

Address: _____

Dated: _____

[Signature]

SHDOCS:165784846.2